STATE OF MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION **JEFFERSON CITY**

JUNE 11, 1996

CASE NO: EM-96-149

٠.,

James J. Cook, Joseph H. Raybuck, Attorneys, Union Electric Company, P.O. Box 149, (MC 1310), St. Louis, MO 63166

Richard W. French, French & Stewart, 1001 Cherry St., Suite 302, Columbia, MO 65201

James C. Swearengen, Brydon, Swearengen & England P.C., 312 É. Capitol Áve., P.O. Box 456, Jefferson City, MO 65102-0456

Gary W. Duffy, Brydon, Swearengen & England P.C., 312 E. Capitol Ave., P. O. Box 456, Jefferson City, MO 65102-0456

Michael C. Pendergast, Assistant General Counsel, Laclede Gas Co., 720 Olive St., Room 1520, St. Louis, MO 63101

Thomas M. Byrne, Attorney for Mississippi River Transmission Corporation, 9900 Clayton Rd., St. Louis, MO 63124

William A. Spencer, Attorney at Law, 215 E. Capitol Ave., P.O. Box 717, Jefferson City, MO 65102 Robert C. Johnson and Diana M. Schmidt, Peper, Martin, Jensen, Maichel and Hetlage,

720 Olive St., 24th Floor, St. Louis, MO 63101-2396
Susan B. Cunningham, Staff Attorney, Kansas City Power & Light Co., 1201 Walnut St.,
P.O. Box 418679, Kansas City, MO 64141-9679
Paul S. DeFord, Lathrop & Norquist, L.C., 2345 Grand Blvd., Suite 2500, Kansas City, MO 64108
Jeremiah W. Nixon, Attorney General, and Daryl R. Hylton, Assistant Attorney General,
221 W. High St., P.O. Box 899, Jefferson City, MO 65102
Marilyn S. Teitelbaum, Schuchat, Cook & Werner, 1221 Locust St., 2nd Floor, St. Louis, MO 63101
James M. Fischer, Attorney at Law, 101 W. McCarty St., Suite 215, Jefferson City, MO 65101
Lewis R. Mills, Jr., Deputy Public Counsel, Office of the Public Counsel, P.O. Box 7800 Lewis R. Mills, Jr., Deputy Public Counsel, Office of the Public Counsel, P.O. Box 7800, Jefferson City, MO 65102

Enclosed find certified copy of ORDER in the above-numbered case(s).

Favil L Kauch

David L. Rauch **Executive Secretary**

Uncertified Copy:

Earl Eakins, 1649 State Highway N, Chaffee, MO 63740

Charles J. Fishman, President, Trigen-St. Louis Energy Corporation, One Ashley Place, St. Louis, MO 63102

Jim Berger, Asst. Business Manager, Local 309, IBEW, 2000 Mall St. (Rte 157), Collinsville, IL 62234

Dave White, Business Manager, Local 2, IBEW, 209 Flora Dr., P.O. Box 1045, Jefferson City, MO 65102

Michael Datillo, Business Manager, Local 1455, IBEW, 5570 Fyler Ave., St. Louis, MO 63139 Gary Roan, Business Manager, Local 702, IBEW, 106 N. Monroe, West Frankfort, IL 62896 John W. McKinney, Missouri Public Service, 10700 E. 350 Highway, P.O. Box 11739, Kansas City, MO 64138

Robert B. Fancher, Vice President-Finance, Empire District Electric Co., 602 Joplin, P.O. Box 127, Joplin, MO 64801

Kenneth J. Neises, Senior Vice President-Gas Supply & Regulatory Affairs, Laclede Gas Co., 720 Olive St., Room 1514, St. Louis, MO 63101

Joe Lakshmanan, Illinois Power Company, 500 South 27th St., P.O. Box 511, Decatur, Illinois 62525

F. Jay Cummings, Vice President, Rates & Regulatory Affairs, Southern Union Gas Co.,

STATE OF MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

At a Session of the Public Service Commission held at its office in Jefferson City on the 11th day of June, 1996.

In the Matter of the Application of Union Electric Company for an Order Authorizing (1) Certain Merger Transactions Involving Union Electric Company; (2) the Transfer of Certain Assets, Real Estate, Leased Property, Easements and Contractual Agreements to Central Illinois Public Service Company; and (3) in Connection, Therewith Certain Other Related Transactions.

Case No. EM-96-149

ORDER REGARDING THIRD MOTION TO COMPEL

On November 7, 1995, Union Electric Company (UE) filed an application with the Commission requesting an order from the Commission authorizing certain merger transactions. On November 15, 1995, the Commission issued an order and notice, providing notice of this proposal to the public and providing for intervention of proper parties. The Commission adopted a proposed procedural schedule in this matter on January 22, 1996.

On May 29, 1996, the Office of the Public Counsel (OPC) filed its third motion to compel UE to answer a series of data requests to which UE objected. UE filed its answer on June 4, 1996, stating that it currently objects to two of the subject data requests, those being numbers 675 and 676, attached to this order for reference as Attachment A.

The OPC, in the above-referenced request, seeks substantial information regarding the analyses of the costs and benefits of a new UE automatic meter reading program. In its motion the OPC maintains that the information is relevant and important in determining whether UE's analysis of the costs and benefits of the proposed merger are consistent with the

method of analyses of the costs and benefits of other UE long-term investments.

In its response, UE objects to the data requests on the basis that the stated intent, a comparison of methods of evaluating the costs and benefits of long-term investments, would yield little useful data, as the situations are vastly different. UE requests the Commission sustain its objection to data requests numbered 675 and 676 as little or no relevant and useful information would be obtained.

The Commission has considered the arguments of both parties in this matter and the Commission finds little or no relevant comparison, for purposes of this case, between the analysis of the costs and benefits of the UE automated meter reading program and the proposed corporate merger. The Commission is of the opinion that little, if anything, of relevance or other probative value would be gained from ordering compliance with the instant data requests. The Commission will, therefore, deny the OPC's third motion to compel.

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED:

- 1. That, for the reasons as set out above, the third motion to compel of the Office of the Public Counsel is hereby denied.
 - 2. That this order shall become effective on the date hereof.

(SEAL)

David L. Rauch Executive Secretary

BY THE COMMISSION

Zobrist, Chm., McClure, Kincheloe and Drainer, CC., Concur. Crumpton, C., Absent. ALJ: Derque

Attachment A



No. 675

Data Information Request from Office of Public Counsel to Union Electric Case No. EM-96-149

Information Requested:

Please provide a copy of all documents created by or for UE that include descriptions or analyses of the costs and benefits of installing a new automated meter reading (AMR) system. This DR should be interpreted to include documents pertaining to the specific AMR system that UE has decided to install, as well as documents pertaining to the costs and benefits of AMR systems in general.

Information Provided:

Union Electric Company objects to this data request as it seeks material which is neither relevant nor reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of evidence relevant to the merger proceeding.

No. 676

Data Information Request from Office of Public Counsel to Union Electric Case No. EM-96-149

Information Requested:

How much will UE's new AMR system cost and how long will it take to recoup that cost? Please provide a copy of all workpapers that support your answer.

Information Provided:

Union Electric Company objects to this data request as it seeks material which is neither relevant nor reasonably calculated to lead to the discovery of evidence relevant to the merger proceeding.

Derque/Hagemeyer

CASE NO	Em-96-149
	K.Z. \$
_	Chairman
	Commissioner
	Commissioner Wh Swat
	Commissioner
3/1 584 c	Commissioner 4-0 1
	611

STATE OF MISSOURI

OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

I have compared the preceding copy with the original on file in this office and I do hereby certify the same to be a true copy therefrom and the whole thereof.

WITNESS my hand and seal of the Public Service Commission, at Jefferson City,

Missouri, this 11 day of JUNE, 1996

David L. Rauch Executive Secretary

First L Kauch