#### BEFORE MISSOURI THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

In the Matter of a Commission Inquiry into \$ the Possibility of Impairment without \$ Case No. TO-2004-0207 Unbundled Local Circuit Switching When \$ Serving the Mass Market \$

## RESPONSE OF BIG RIVER TELEPHONE AND SOCKET TELECOM TO SBC'S RESPONSE TO ORDER DIRECTING FILING

Come Now Big River Telephone Company, LLC and Socket Telecom, LLC ("Missouri CLECs") pursuant to Commission order herein and 4 CSR 240-2.080(15) and for their Response to SBC Missouri's ("SBC's") Response to Order Directing Filing<sup>1</sup> respectfully state to the Commission as follows.

#### I. Response to Impairment Issues

Missouri CLECs respectfully offer the following responses to the impairment issues that the Commission identified in Paragraph 8 of its Order Creating Case and Establishing Initial Filing Deadlines:

a. The incumbent local exchange carrier's ("ILEC's") proposal for geographically defining the market;

In its Triennial Review Order ("TRO"), the Federal Communications Commission ("FCC") directed state commissions to determine whether competing carriers are impaired without access to unbundled circuit switching for mass market customers. TRO, para. 493.

As directed by the FCC, in order to apply the mass market switching triggers, the Commission must determine the appropriate geographic market areas. In the TRO, the FCC recognized the need to be very specific in market assessments by requiring that each market must be smaller than the entire state.

Consistent with the FCC's TRO, Missouri CLECs believe that the market areas identified by the Commission need to be small enough to ensure that large numbers of mass market consumers are not unintentionally left without alternatives for basic local telephone service. Metropolitan Statistical Areas ("MSAs") are simply too large to make meaningful determinations of impairment.

It is most appropriate that the Commission establish geographic market areas at a wire center level. It is at the wire center, where alternative switching is either available or not. It is at the wire center where competitors are going to be impaired in providing local switching, or not.

b. The ILEC's proposal for defining the appropriate DS0/DS1 cross-over between the mass market and the enterprise market;

Pursuant to Rule 319(d)(2)(iii)(B)(4), the state commission is to determine the appropriate DS0 cutoff, which the Triennial Review Order defines as the maximum number of DS0 loops below the cross over point "where it makes economic sense for the multi-line customer to be served via a DS1 loop". Above the cutoff level, the multi-line customer is considered to be a part of the enterprise market, while at or below the cutoff the multi-line customer is considered to be a part of the mass market when analyzing impairment for unbundled local switching.

It is most appropriate that the cross over point be established at 12 DS0s. Too low of a cross over point will result in many mass market local telephone service consumers having no viable alternative to the incumbent telephone service provider. The determination of

2

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> To the extent CenturyTel's Response overlaps SBC's Response, Missouri CLECs' positions are the same.

the cross over point for providing service via DS1 is especially critical in rural areas served by Missouri CLECs.

c. The geographic areas where the ILEC will be challenging impairment based on its response to Nos. 1 and 2;

Missouri CLECs do not believe that SBC has properly defined the market and oppose SBC's request for relief.

d. The competitor(s) that the ILEC asserts satisfies the impairment triggers for mass market switching in each geographic market;

Missouri CLECs take no position on this issue at this time.

e. <u>The specific routes where the ILEC will be challenging the finding of impairment for dedicated transport;</u>

SBC has failed to meet its burden for challenging the FCC's national impairment finding for dedicated transport for the routes that SBC identified in its November 12<sup>th</sup> filing.

Specifically, SBC alleges without proper evidentiary support or explanation that the FCC's triggers have been met in the specified routes. SBC's pleading is ambiguous as to the specific relief that it seeks (i.e. SBC has improperly lumped together different types of transport that are subject to different standards under the FCC's order). Therefore, Missouri CLECs respectfully urge the Commission to affirm the FCC's finding that all CLECs are impaired without access to dedicated transport in Missouri.

f. The identity of the competitor(s) that the ILEC asserts satisfies the impairment triggers for dedicated transport; and

SBC fails to provide proper evidentiary support to establish that competitors satisfy the FCC's impairment triggers in the specified routes. For example, SBC fails to identify carriers for the specified routes. (A general list of carriers that allegedly provide transport in Missouri is

insufficient.) Therefore, the FCC's national impairment finding for dedicated transport applies in Missouri.

g. The specific customer locations where the ILEC will be challenging the finding of impairment for enterprise loops.

SBC has failed to meet its burden for challenging the FCC's national impairment finding for enterprise loops for the customer locations that SBC identified in its November 12<sup>th</sup> filing. Specifically, SBC alleges without proper evidentiary support that the FCC's triggers have been met in the specified customer locations. SBC's pleading is ambiguous as to the specific relief that it seeks (i.e. SBC has improperly lumped together different types of loops that are subject to different standards under the FCC's order). Additionally, SBC fails to identify carriers for the specified locations. Therefore, Missouri CLECs respectfully urge the Commission to affirm the FCC's finding that all CLECs are impaired without access to enterprise loops in Missouri.

#### II. Response to SBC's Batch Hot Cut Proposal

Missouri CLECs take no position on this issue at this time.

Missouri CLECs reserve the right to respond to any change in position presented by SBC under the various reservation of rights found throughout SBC's Response. Further, given the high-level perspective offered by the legal conclusions in SBC's Response, Missouri CLECs reserve the right to respond to any more specific arguments that may be presented.

# CURTIS, OETTING, HEINZ, GARRETT & O'KEEFE, P.C.

/s/ Carl J. Lumley

Carl J. Lumley, #32869 Leland B. Curtis, #20550 130 S. Bemiston, Suite 200 Clayton, Missouri 63105 (314) 725-8788 (314) 725-8789 (FAX) clumley@cohgs.com lcurtis@cohgs.com

Attorneys for Big River Telephone, LLC and Socket Telecom, LLC

### **Certificate of Service**

	A	true a	nd c	orre	ect co	py of	f the	fo	regoing	was	servec	1 սյ	pon	the	parties	s id	lenti	fied	on	the
attach	ıed	service	list	on	this	17th	day	of	Novem	ber,	2003,	by	plac	ing	same	in	the	U.S.	M	ail,
postage paid.																				

/s/ Carl J. Lumley

Dana K. Joyce P.O. Box 360 200 Madison St., Suite 800 Jefferson City, MO 65102

John B. Coffman P.O. Box 7800 200 Madison St., Suite 640 Jefferson City, MO 65102

Paul G. Lane SBC Missouri One SBC Center, Room 3520 St. Louis, MO 63101

Lisa C. Hendricks Sprint Missouri, Inc. d/b/a Sprint 6450 Sprint Parkway Overland Park, KS 66251

Larry W. Dority Spectra Communications Group, LLC d/b/a CenturyTel 101 Madison, Suite 400 Jefferson City, MO 65101

Legal Department 877-Ring Again P.O. Box 720429 Dallas, TX 75372

Legal Department Accutel of Texas, Inc. 7900 W. John Carpenter Freeway Dallas, TX 75237

Legal Department ACN Communications Services 32991 Hamilton Court Farmington Hills, MI 48333

Legal Department Advanced Integrated Tech 9855 W. 78th Street, Suite 300 Eden Prairie, MN 55344

Legal Department Affordable Phone Company 808 S. Baker Street Mountain Home, AR 72653 Legal Department Affordaphone, Inc. 1703 16th Street P.O. Box 1220 Bridgeport, Texas 76426

Legal Department Allegiance Telecom of Missouri 9201 N. Central Expressway Dallas, TX 75231

Legal Department Ameritel, Your Phone Company 1307 Central Ave. Hot Springs, AR 71902

Legal Department Atlas Communications, Ltd. 900 Comerica Bldg. Kalamazoo, Michigan 49007

Legal Department BarTel Communications 333 Leffingwell, Suite 101 St. Louis, MO 63122

Legal Department Basicphone, Inc. P.O. Box 220 Orange, TX 77631

Legal Department BBC Telephone, Inc. 154 N. Emporia Witchita, KS 67202 Legal Department

Legal Department Birch Telecom of Missouri 2020 Baltimore Ave. Kansas City, MO 64108

Legal Department BTI 4300 Six Forcks Rd., Suite 400 Raleigh, NC 27609

Legal Department Budget Phone, Inc. 6901 W. 70th Street P.O. Box 19360 Shreveport, LA 71129 Legal Department BullsEye Telecom, Inc. 25900 Greensfield Road Oak Park, MI 48237

Legal Department Buy-Tele Communications, Inc. 6409 Colleyville Blvd. P.O. Box 1170 Colleyville, TX 76034

Legal Department
Camarato Distributing, Inc.
900 Camarato Dr.
P.O. Box 638
Herrin, IL 62948

Legal Department Cbeyond Communications 320 Interstate N. Pkwy, Suite 300 Atlanta, Georgia 30339

Legal Department CD Telecommunications 608 St. Hwy, 165, Suite #5 Branson, MO 65616

Legal Department Chariton Valley Telecom Corporation 109 Butler Macon, MO 63552

Legal Department C12, Inc. 200 Galleria Pkwy., Suite 1200 Atlanta, GA 30339

Legal Department Cinergy Communications 1419 West Lloyd Expressway Evansville, IN 47710

Legal Department Concert Communications Sales 2355 Dulles Corner Blvd., #LBBY Herndon, VA 20171 Legal Department Connect! P.O. Box 619 Bryant, AR 72089

Legal Department Convergent Communications P.O. Box 746237 Arvada, CO 80006

Legal Department Cox Missouri Telecom 5428 Florida Blvd. Baton Rouge, LA 70806

Legal Department Davidson Telecom, LLC 19003 Hodestone Mews Crt. Davidson, NC 28036

Legal Department Delta Phones, Inc. 245 Illinois Street Delhi, LA 71232

Legal Department DMJ Communications, Inc. P.O. Box 12690 Odessa, TX 79768

Legal Department dPi-Tele.-Connect, LLC 1720 Windward Concourse, #250 Alpharetta, GA 3000

Legal Department DSLnet Communications, LLC 545 Long Wharf Dr., 5th Floor New Haven, CN 06511

Legal Department e.sprie Communications 22685 Holiday Park Dr., Suite 80 Sterling, VA 20166

Legal Department Ernest Communications 5275 Triangle Parkway, Suite 150 Norcross, GA 30092 Legal Department Everest Midwest Licensee LLC 9647 Lackman Road Lenexa, KS 66219

Legal Department
Excel Telecommunications
1600 Viceroy Dr.
Dallas, TX 75235

Legal Department
EZ Talk Communications,
LLC
4727 S. Main
Stafford, Texas 77477

Legal Department FamilyTel of Missouri, LLC 2900 Louisville Ave. Monroe, LA 71201

Legal Department Fast Connections, Inc. P.O. Box 40 Hubbard, OR 97032

Legal Department Global Crossing Local Services, Inc. 1080 Pittsford Victor Rd. Pittsford, NY 14534

Legal Department Global Crossing Telemanagement 1080 Pittsford Victor Rd. Pittsford, NY 14534

Legal Department GlobalCom, Inc. 2100 Sanders Rd., Suite 150 Northbrook, IL 60062

Legal Department GoBeam Services, Inc. 5050 Hopyard Rd., Suite 350 Pleasanton, CA 94588

Legal Department Green Hills Telecommunications 7926 NE State Route M P.O. Box 227 Breckenridge, MO 64625 Legal Department Group Long Distance, Inc. 1 Cavalier Court P.O. Box 534 Ringoes, NJ 08551

Legal Department ICG Telecom Group, Inc 161 Inverness Drive West Englewood, CO 80202

Legal Department Integrated Telecommunications Services, LLC 1500 E. Washington Ave. P.O. Box 892 Jonesboro, AR 72403

Legal Department Ionex Communications, Inc. 2020 Baltimore Kansas City, MO 64108

Legal Department IPvoice Communications, Inc. 14860 Montfort Dr., Suite 210 Dallas, TX 75254

Legal Department KMC Data, LLC 1545 Route 206 Bedminster, NJ 07921

Legal Department KMC Telecom III 1545 Route 206 Bedminster, NJ 07921

Legal Department Level 3 Communications, I 1025 Eldorado Blvd. Broomfield, CO 80021

Legal Department Local Line America, Inc. P.O. Box 4551 Akron, OH 44310

Legal Department
Magnus Communications,
Inc.
340 S. Broadview
Cape Girardeau, MO 63703

Legal Department Mark Twain Communications P.O. Box 128 Hurdland, MO 63547

Legal Department Maxcess, Inc. P.O. Box 951419 Lake Mary, FL 32795

Legal Department Maxcom, Inc. 1250 Wood Branch Dr., Suite 600 Houston, TX 77079

Legal Department Max-Tel Communications 1720 Windward Concourse Alpharetta, GA 30005

Legal Department McLeodUSA Telecommunications Services, Inc. 6400 C Street, SW P.O. Box 3177 Cedar Rapids, IA 52406

Legal Department Metro Communications Co. P.O. Box 555 Sullivan, IL 61951

Legal Department Metro Teleconnect Company 2150 Herr Street Harrisburg, PA 17103

Legal Department Midwestern Tel 2751 N. Ashland Ave. Chicago, IL 60614

Legal Department Missouri Comm South, Inc. 2909 N. Buckner Blvd., Suite 800 Dallas, TX 75228

Legal Department Missouri State Discount 804 Elkins Lake Huntsville, TX 77340 Legal Department Missouri Telecom, Inc. 515 Cleveland, Suite C Monett, MO 64708

Legal Department Navigator Telecommunications 8525 Riverwood Park Dr. P.O. Box 13860 North Little Rock, AR 72113

Legal Department North County Communications 3802 Rosecrans Street San Diego, CA 92110

Legal Department
Now Acquisition Corporation
180 N. Wacker Dr., Suite 3
Chicago, IL 60606
Carol Keith
NuVox Communications
16090 Swingley Ridge Rd.,
Suite 500
Chesterfield, MO 63017

Legal Department Omniplex 1250 Wood Branch Park Dr., Suite 600 Houston, TX 77079

Legal Department Phone-Link, Inc. 1700 Eastpoint Parkway, #270 Louisville, KY 40223

Legal Department PNG Telecommunications 100 Commercial Dr. Fairfield, OH 45014

Legal Department Popp Telecom Inc. 620 Mendelssohn Ave., North Golden Valley, MN 55427

Legal Department Premiere Paging & Cellular 1114 Blue Bird Lane Liberty, MO 64068 Legal Department QCC, Inc. 8829 Bond Street Overland Park, KS 66214

Legal Department QuantumShift Communications 88 Rowland Way Novato, CA 94945

Legal Department Quick-Tel, Inc. P.O. Box 1220 Bridgeport, TX 76426

Legal Department Qwest Communications Corp. 1801 California St., 47th Floor Denver, CO 80202

Legal Department Reliant Communications 801 International Parkway Lake Mary, FL 32746

Legal Department Ren-Tel Communications 33 Black Forest Run Douglasville, GA 30134

Legal Department Rocky Mountain Broadband. 999 18th St., Suite 1835 Denver, CO 80202

Legal Department SBA Broadband Services, Inc. 5900 Broken Sound Pkwy, NW Boca Raton, FL 33487

Legal Department ServiSense,com, Inc. 115 Shawnmut Road Canton, MA 02021

Legal Department Simply Local Services, Inc. 2225 Apollo Dr. Fenton, MO 63026 Legal Department Smoke Signal Communications 8700 S. Gessner Houston, TX 77074

Legal Department Snappy Phone 6901 W. 70th Street Shreveport, LA 71129

Legal Department Socket Telecom, LLC 811 Cherry St., Suite 210 Columbia, MO 65201

Legal Department Southern Telecom Network P.O. Box 1161 Mountain Home, AR 72653

Legal Department Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. 2620 S.W. 27th Ave. Miami, FL 33133

Legal Department Suretel, Inc. 5 N. McCormick Oklahoma City, OK 73127

Legal Department Talk America, Inc. 6805 Route 202 New Hope, PA 18938

Legal Department Tel Com Plus 2277 19th Ave., SW Largo, FL 33774

Legal Department TelCove 712 N. Main Street Coudersport, PN 16915

Legal Department Telefonos Para Todos 14681 Midway Road Addison, TX 75001 Legal Department Telepacific Communications 515 S. Flower St., 47th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071

Legal Department Telera Communications 910 E. Hamilton Ave., Suite 200 Campbell, CA 95008

Legal Department Tele-Reconnect, Inc. 16925 Manchester Rd. Wildwood, MO 63040

Legal Department Teligent Services, Inc. 460 Herndon Pkwy, Suite 100 Herndon, VA 20170

Legal Department The Cube 7941 Katy Freeway, Suite 304 Houston, TX 77024

Legal Department Transamerican Telephone 209 E. University Danton, TX 76201

Legal Department TruComm Corporation 1608 Barclay Blvd. Buffalo Grove, IL 60089

Legal Department Unite 303 N. Jefferson P.O. Box 891 Kearney, MO 64060

Legal Department Valor Communications CLEC of Missouri 201 E. John Carpenter Freeway, #200 Irving, TX 75062

Legal Department VarTec Telecom, Inc. 1600 Viceroy Dr. Dallas, TX 75235 Legal Department Verizon Select Services, Inc. 6665 N. MacArthur Blvd. Irving, TX 75039

William D. Steinmeier Xspedius Communications 2031 Tower Drive P.O. Box 104595 Jefferson City, MO 65110

Legal Department
Z-Tel Communications
601 S. Harbour Island Blvd.,
Suite 220
Tampa, FL 33602

Mary Ann Young Ameritel Missouri, Inc. 2031 Tower Drive P.O. Box 104595 Jefferson City, MO 65110

Legal Department American Fiber Network, Inc. 9401 Indian Creek Pkwy, Suite 140 Overland Park, KS 66210

Legal Department Atlas Mobilfone, Inc. 1903 S. Glenstone Springfield, MO 65804

Legal Department Bellsouth BSE, Inc. 400 Perimeter Center Terrace, Suite 400 Atlanta, Georgia 30346

Legal Department Big River Telephone Company, LLC 240 Souht Minnesota P.O. Box 1608 Cape Girardeau, MO 63072

Legal Department Logix Communications Co. 2950 N. Loop W., Suite 1200 Houstin, TX 77092 Legal Department O1 Communications of Missouri, LLC 2000 E. Lamar Blvd., Suite 730 Arlington, TX 76006

Legal Department WTX Communications 11001 Wilcrest Dr., Suite 100 Houston, TX 77099

Legal Department XO Missouri, Inc. 2700 Summit Ave. Plano, TX 75074

Legal Department 1-800-Reconex, Inc. 2500 Industrial Avenue Hubbard, OR 97032

David Woodsmall Corporate Counsel Xspedious Communications 5555 Winghaven Blvd., Suite 300 O'Fallon, MO 63366

Charles Brent Stewart Stewart & Keevil, LLC 4603 John Garry Drive, Suite 11 Columbia, MO 65203

Sheldon K. Stock Jason L. Ross 10 South Broadway, Suite 2000 St. Louis, MO 63102-1774

Stephen F. Morris MCI WorldCom 701 Brazos, Suite 600 Austin, TX, Suite 600 Austin, TX 78701

William J. Cobb, III COVAD Communications 100 Congress Ave., Suite 2000 Austin, TX 78701 Legal Department 1-800-REconex, Inc. 2500 Industrial Avenue Hubbard, OR 97032

Legal Department CAN Communications Services 32991 Hamilton Court Farmington Hills, MI 48333

Katherine J. Mudge Smith Majcher & Mudge, LLP 816 Congress, Suite 1270 Austin, TX 78701

Legal Department Buy-Tel Communications 6409 Colleyville Boulevard P.O. Box 1170 Colleyville, TX 76034

Legal Department ExOp of Missouri 303 N. Jefferson P.O. Box 891 Kearney, MO 64060

Rebecca B. DeCook AT&T 1875 Lawrence Street, Suite 1575 Denver, CO 80202

J. Steve Weber AT&T 101 W. McCarty, Suite 216 Jefferson City, MO 65101