To: The Missouri Public Service Commission

From: OPC Witness Ms. Keri Roth

Date: 9/4/2018

## RE: WM-2019-0018 MEMORANDUM ON RATE COMPARISON BETWEEN WATER SERVICE RATES AND SEWER SERVICE RATES

I have done an analysis, which concludes that adopting the Missouri-American Water Company's tariffed rates for non-St. Louis County would result in the highest average net increase in rates compared to adopting Rogue Creek Utility's existing rates or adopting Missouri-American Water Company's tariffed rates for the City of Lawson.

As the foundation for my conclusion, I have reviewed (i) the Rogue Creek Utility (RCU)'s tariffed rates, (ii) the Missouri-American Water Company's tariffed rates for the City of Lawson (Lawson), and (iii) the Missouri-American Water Company's tariffed rates for non-St. Louis county residents (MAWC).

I ran three different scenarios assuming usage of 2,000, 3,000, or 4,000. In every scenario, the MAWC sewer rate was higher and the MAWC water rate was lower resulting in a net increase in the average customer's utility bill. In assessing the average net impact for each customer, I also have reviewed Staff's Official Case File Memorandum, and on page 2 of 13, the Staff's Memorandum indicates that all RCU customers take water services and sewer services. Therefore, my analysis of the average net impact on a customer did not weigh one service greater than another because customers take both services.

From my review, I conclude that the average customer of RCU will see a net increase between \$4.63 and \$9.25 in their utility bill if the Commission adopts the MAWC rate for non-St. Louis County residents. On the other hand, if the Commission adopts Lawson rates, total bills are likely to decrease between \$29.24 to \$8.06 per month. In support of my conclusions, I have prepared a chart that compares each scenario, which shows as follows:

WATER											
	Customer		Commodity Charge per								
	C	Charge	1,000 gal			2,000 use		3,000 use		4,000 use	
RCU	\$	23.06	\$	3.89		\$	30.84	\$	34.73	\$	38.62
Lawson	\$	23.33	\$	10.28	**	\$	33.61	\$	43.89	\$	54.17
MAWC	\$	9.00	\$	6.25		\$	21.50	\$	27.75	\$	34.00

W/ATFR

\*\*Lawson customer charge includes the first 1,000 gallons

SEWER											
			Corr	nmodity							
	Cu	stomer	Cha	rge per							
	Charge		1,000 gal		2,0	2,000 use		3,000 use		4,000 use	
RCU	\$	44.16		n/a	\$	44.16	\$	44.16	\$	44.16	
Lawson	\$	7.95	\$	4.20 **	\$	12.15	\$	16.35	\$	20.55	
MAWC	\$	58.13		n/a	\$	58.13	\$	58.13	\$	58.13	

\*\*Lawson customer charge includes first 1,000 gallons