NEWMAN, COMLEY & RUTH

PROFESSIONAL CORPORATION ATTORNEYS AND COUNSELORS AT LAW MONROE BLUFF EXECUTIVE CENTER 601 MONROE STREET, SUITE 301 P.O. BOX 537

JEFFERSON CITY, MISSOURI 65102-0537 www.ncrpc.com November 17, 2003

TELEPHONE: (573) 634-2266 FACSIMILE: (573) 636-3306

The Honorable Dale Hardy Roberts Secretary/Chief Regulatory Law Judge Missouri Public Service Commission P.O. Box 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102-0360

FILED NOV 1 7 2003

Gerales Gernifission

Re:

ROBERT K. ANGSTEAD

CATHLEEN A. MARTIN

STEPHEN G. NEWMAN

MARK W. COMLEY

JOHN A. RUTH

Case No. TO-2004-0207

Dear Judge Roberts:

Please find enclosed for filing in the referenced matter the original and five copies of an Entry of Appearance; CLEC Coalition Response to SBC Missouri's and CenturyTel's Response to Commission Order Directing Filing; and Petition for Leave for Bill Magness to Appear on Behalf of AT&T Communications of the Southwest, Inc., AT&T Local Services on Behalf of TCG St. Louis, Inc. and TCG Kansas City, Inc., Birch Telecom of Missouri, Inc. and Z-Tel Communications, Inc.

Would you please bring this filing to the attention of the appropriate Commission personnel.

Please contact me if you have any questions regarding this filing. Thank you.

Very truly yours,

NEWMAN, COMLEY & RUTH P.C.

By:

Mark W. Comley comleym@ncrpc.com

MWC:ab Enclosure

cc:

Office of Public Counsel

General Counsel's Office

Rebecca DeCook Bill Magness

All parties of record

Celebrating 10 Years of Excellence in Legal Services Established 1993

BEFORE THE MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION NOV 1 7 2003

IN THE MATTER OF A)	Service Commission
COMMISSION INQUIRY)	VICE COMITIES OF
INTO THE POSSIBILITY OF)	- 1001
IMPAIRMENT WITHOUT)	Case No. TO-2004-0207
UNBUNDLED LOCAL CIRCUIT)	
SWITCHING WHEN SERVING)	
THE MASS MARKET)	

CLEC COALITION RESPONSE TO SBC MISSOURI'S AND CENTURYTEL'S RESPONSE TO COMMISSION ORDER DIRECTING FILING

COME NOW AT&T Communications of the Southwest, Inc., AT&T Local Services on behalf of TCG St. Louis, Inc. and TCG Kansas City, Inc., Birch Telecom of Missouri, Inc., and Z-Tel Communications, Inc. ("CLEC Coalition") and file, pursuant to the Commission's Order Directing Filing, this response to SBC Missouri's and CenturyTel's November 10, 2003 filings responsive to the Commission's Order. The CLEC Coalition responds in this filing regarding Mass Market Switching issues.

- 1. The Commission took an important first step in efficiently processing the Mass Market Switching impairment case by requiring Missouri ILECs to identify where they intend to challenge the national finding of impairment in Missouri. It is incumbent on the ILECs to inform the industry where they plan to challenge impairment so that the scope of the proceeding may be determined.
- 2. In its filing, SBC stated its intention to challenge Mass Market Switching impairment in the following Metropolitan Statistical Areas ("MSAs"): St. Louis, Missouri-Illinois, Kansas City, Missouri-Kansas, and Springfield, Missouri. CenturyTel asserted it would also challenge the

impairment finding in the St. Louis MSA. Both SBC and CenturyTel (the "ILECs") contend they will make their cases "by showing that the triggers identified in the TRO have been satisfied," and that both do "not intend to present a potential deployment analysis."

- 3. The ILECs also stated in their filings, however, that (as SBC put it) "to the extent a geographic market or DS0/DS1 cutoff different than that proposed by SBC Missouri is considered, SBC reserves the right to present evidence of non-impairment through a potential deployment analysis as permitted under applicable FCC rules." The ILECs also reserved their right to present a potential deployment case if the Commission implements what SBC characterizes as a "cooling off" period on subsequent TRO-related proceedings. The ILECs further reserved rights to add information, based on discovery and additional analysis, regarding the identity of other companies it asserts satisfy the mass market switching triggers. Finally, the ILECs added a generalized reservation asserting the right "to withdraw, revise or otherwise modify its positions consistent with the USTA Decision, the Triennial Review Order and/or other relevant government action."
- 4. The ILECs' multi-layered reservations diminish much of the certainty that could have been achieved through this initial filing. Nevertheless, the identification of specific proposed markets and "trigger candidate" companies will assist the parties in planning for the mass market switching proceedings. The CLEC Coalition does not agree to waive the opportunity to request that the Commission consider alternatives to the geographic market or DS0/DS1 cutoff proposals offered by SBC. Both the geographic and DS0/DS1 cutoff aspects of "defining the market" (or, more accurately, defining the impairment zones in a state) require factual analysis that the CLEC Coalition cannot

SBC Filing, at ¶ 8; CenturyTel Filing, at ¶ 6 (duplicate language in both pleadings).

² SBC Filing, at ¶ 8; CenturyTel Filing, at ¶ 6 (same language with "CenturyTel" substituted for "SBC Missouri").

³ SBC Filing, at ¶ 8, n.5 (this reservation of rights is echoed by CenturyTel at ¶ 6, n.6 of its filing).

⁴ SBC Filing, at ¶¶ 8-9; CenturyTel Filing, at ¶ 6, n.5.

undertake until discovery responses have been received from SBC. Unlike SBC, the CLEC Coalition companies have not established a standardized position on these issues that will apply to any factual setting in any state.

- 5. The TRO calls on State Commissions to "define the markets in which it will evaluate impairment by determining the relevant geographic area to include in each market." Each "market" must be defined "on a granular level" based on consideration of specific facts itemized in the TRO. The specific facts include the location of CLEC customers. SBC, as provider of wholesale UNE and resale services to CLECs, has the best information available aggregating the number of CLEC customers in its territory in Missouri.
- 6. The FCC also left to State commissions the factual determination of the appropriate "cut off" or "cross over" point between DS0 (mass market) and DS1 (enterprise market) customers. The TRO and FCC rule contemplate that the cut-off for multi-line DS0 voice customers should not be established without the introduction and consideration of record evidence regarding "the point where it makes economic sense for a multi-line customer to be served via a DS1 loop." The "default" cutover referenced in the TRO, and endorsed by the ILECs, is not based on the type of analysis the FCC demands the states conduct in the 9-month impairment proceedings. The CLEC Coalition believes the evidence will show that the cutover is not properly established at the 3-line level when the evidence called for by the FCC is reviewed.
 - 7. In the TRO framework, these market definition components play a critical part the

⁵ SBC Filing, note 1 CenturyTel Filing, note 1.

⁶ TRO ¶495.

⁷ Id. In defining markets, state commissions "must take into consideration the locations of customers actually being served (if any) by competitors, the variation in factors affecting competitors' ability to serve each group of customers, and competitors' ability to target and serve specific markets economically and efficiently using currently available technologies."

assessment of whether there is impairment. The market definition is driven by factual determinations, and thus must be supported by record evidence. In addition, because the market definition components play such an important role in the Commission's consideration of impairment, no party should be expected to waive its rights to present evidence on these issues.

- 8. Given that the "market definition" issues will be contested -- and require factual evidence and determinations pursuant to the TRO -- the CLEC Coalition respectfully requests that the hearing of market definition not be "bifurcated" from the remainder of the contested issues, so that parties will have sufficient time to develop testimony on all the factual issues in the mass market switching proceeding. As the CLEC Coalition noted in an earlier filling, a hearing without sufficient opportunity for discovery and presentation of prefiled testimony also would not permit the parties to establish the necessary factual basis for market definition issues. This, in turn, could prevent the Commission from being able to fulfill its obligation to make the appropriate factual findings regarding market definition under the TRO.
- 9. The CLEC Coalition will be represented at the upcoming prehearing conference on October 18, 2003, and looks forward to further discussing matters related to the mass market switching proceeding at that time.

Respectfully submitted,

⁸ TRO ¶497.

Bill Magness

Casey & Gentz, L.L.P.

919 Congress Avenue, Suite 1060

Austin, TX 78701

(512) 225-0019 (direct)

(512) 480-9200 (fax)

bmagness@phonelaw.com

Mark W. Comley

° #**28/**84

NEWMAN, COMLEY & RUTH P. 601 Monroe Street, Suite 301

P.O. Box 537

Jefferson City, MO 65102-0537

(573) 634-2266

(573) 636-3306 FAX

Attorneys for AT&T Communications of the Southwest, Inc., AT&T Local Services on behalf of TCG St. Louis, Inc. and TCG Kansas City, Inc., Birch Telecom of Missouri, Inc., and Z-Tel Communications, Inc.

Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing document was sent via e-mail on this ____/7___ day of November, 2003, to General Counsel's Office at gencounsel@psc.state.mo.us; Office of Public Counsel at opcservice@ded.state.mo.us; Paul G. Lane, SBC Missouri, at paul.lane@sbc.com, and via U.S. Mail, postage prepaid, to:

Lisa C Hendricks Sprint MO Inc. d/b/a Sprint 6450 Sprint Parkway Overland Park, KS 66251

Legal Department Accutel of TX Inc. 7900 W. John Carpenter Freeway Dallas, TX 75237 Larry W Dority 101 Madison-Suite 400 Jefferson City, MO 65101

Legal Department ACN Communication Services, Inc. 32991 Hamilton Court Farmington Hills, MI 48333 Legal Department 877-Ring Again P.O. Box 720429 Dallas, TX 75372

Legal Department Advanced Integrated Technologies, Inc. 9855 W. 78th St. ,Ste. 300 Eden Prairie, MN 55344 Legal Department Affordable Phone Company 808 S. Baker Street Mountain Home, AR 72653

Legal Department Alltel Communications, Inc. 1705 S. Lillian Ave. P.O. Box 180 Bolivar, MO 65613

Legal Department
BarTel Communications, Inc.
333 Leffingwell, Ste. 101
St. Louis, MO 63122

Legal Department BTI 4300 Six Forcks Rd, Ste. 400 Raleigh, North Carolina, 27609

Legal Department Buy-Tel Communications, Inc. 6409 Colleyville Blvd. P.O. Box 1170 Colleyville, TX 76034

Legal Department CD Telecommunications, LLC 607 St. Hwy. 165 Ste. #5 Branson, MO 65616

Legal Department Cinergy Communications Company 1419 West Lloyd Expressway Evansville, Indiana, 47710

Legal Department Convergent Communications Services, Inc. P.O. Box 746237 Arvada, CO 80006

Legal Department Delta Phones, Inc. 245 Illinois Street Delhi, LA 71232 Legal Department Affordaphone, Inc. 1703 16th Street P.O. Box 1220 Bridgeport, TX 76426

Legal Department Ameritel, Your Phone Company 1307 Central Ave. Hot Springs, AR 71901

Legal Department Basicphone, Inc. P.O. Box 220 Orange, TX 77631

Legal Department Budget Phone, Inc 6901 W. 70th St. P.O. Box 19360 Shreveport, LA 71129

Legal Department Camarato Distributing, Inc. 900 Camarato Dr. P.O. Box 638 Herrin, IL 62948

Legal Department Chariton Valley Telecom Corp. 109 Butler Macon, MO 63552

Legal Department Concert Communications Sales, LLC 2355 Dulles Corner Blvd. #LBBY Herndon, VA 20171-3428

Legal Department Cox Missouri Telecom, L.L.C. 5428 Florida Blvd. Baton Rouge, LA 70806

Legal Department DMJ Communications, Inc. P.O. Box 12690 Odessa, TX 79768 Mary A Young P.O. Box 104595 Jefferson City, MO 65110-4595

Legal Department Atlas Communications, LTD. 900 Comerica Bldg. Kalamazoo, MI 49007

Legal Department BBC Telephone, Inc. 154 N. Emporia Witchita, KS 67202

Legal Department BullsEye Telecom, Inc. 25900 Greenfield Rd., Ste. 330 Oak Park, MI 48237

Legal Department Cbeyond Communications, LLC 320 Interstate N. Pkwy, Ste. 300 Atlanta, GA 30339

Legal Department Cl2, Inc. 200 Galleria Pkwy. Ste. 1200 Atlanta, GA 30339

Legal Department Connect! P.O. Box 619 Bryant, AR 72089

Legal Department
Davidson Telecom, LLC
19003 Hodestone Mews Court
Davidson, NC 28036

Legal Department dPi-Tele-Connect, L.L.C. 1720 Windward Concourse, Ste. 250 Alpharetta, GA 30005 Legal Department
DSLnet Communications, LLC
545 Long Wharf Dr., 5th Floor
New Haven, CT 06511

Legal Department Everest Midwest Licensee LLC 9647 Lackman Road Lenexa, KS 66219

Legal Department FamilyTel of MO L.L.C. 2900 Louisville Ave. Monroe, LA 71201

Legal Department
Global Crossing Local Services,
Inc.
1080 Pittsford Victor Road
Pittsford, New York, 14534

Legal Department GoBeam Services, Inc. 5050 Hopyard Rd., Ste. 350 Pleasanton, CA 94588

Legal Department ICG Telecom Group, Inc. 161 Inverness Drive West Englewood, Colorado, 80202

Legal Department Ionex Communications, Inc. 2020 Baltimore Kansas City, MO 64108

Legal Department KMC Telecom III, LLC 1545 Route 206 Bedminster, New Jersey, 07921

Legal Department Magnus Communications, Inc. 340 S. Broadview Cape Girardeau, MO 63703 Legal Department e.spire Communications, Inc. 22685 Holiday Park Dr. Ste. 80 Sterling, VA 20166

Legal Department
Excel Telecommunications, Inc.
1600 Viceroy Dr.
Dallas, TX 75235

Legal Department Fast Connections, Inc. P.O. Box 40 Hubbard, OR 97032

Legal Department Global Crossing Telemanagement, Inc. 1080 Pittsford Victor Road Pittsford, New York, 14534

Legal Department
Green Hills Telecommunications
Services
P.O. Box 227
Breckenridge, MO 64625

Legal Department
Integrated Telecommunication
Services, LLC
P.O. Box 892
Jonesboro, AR 72403

Legal Department IPvoice Communications, Inc. 14860 Montfort Dr., Ste. 210 Dallas, TX 75254

Legal Department Level 3 Communications, LLC 1025 Eldorado Blvd. Broomfield, Colorado, 80021

Legal Department
Mark Twain Communications
Company
P.O. Box 128
Hurdland, MO 63547

Legal Department Ernest Communications, Inc. 5275 Triangle Pkwy, Ste. 150 Norcross, GA 30092

Legal Department EZ Talk Communications, L.L.C. 4727 S. Main Stafford, TX 77477

Sheldon K Stock 10 South Broadway 2000 Equitable Bldg. St. Louis, MO 63102

Legal Department Globcom, Incorporated 2100 Sanders Rd. Ste. 150 Northbrook, IL 60062

Legal Department Group Long Distance, Inc. 1 Cavalier Court P.O. Box 534 Ringoes, New Jersey, 08551

Carl J Lumley 130 S. Bemiston, Suite 200 St. Louis, MO 63105

Legal Department KMC Data, L.L.C. 1545 Route 206 Bedminster, New Jersey, 07921

Legal Department Local Line America, Inc. P.O. Box 4551 Akron, Ohio, 44310

Legal Department Maxcess, Inc. P.O. Box 951419 Lake Mary, FL 32795 Legal Department Maxcom, Inc. 1250 Wood Branch Dr., Ste. 600 Houston, TX 77079

Legal Department Metro Teleconnect Companies, Inc. 2150 Herr Street Harrisburg, PA 17103

Legal Department Missouri State Discount Telephone 804 Elkins Lake Huntsville, TX 77340

Legal Department
North County Communications
Corporation
3802 Rosecrans Street, Ste. 485
San Diego, CA 92110

Legal Department Omniplex 1250 Wood Branch Park Dr. Suite 600 Houston, TX 77079

Legal Department
Popp Telcom Incorporated
620 Mendelssohn Ave.
North
Golden Valley, MN 55427

Legal Department
QuantumShift Communications,
Inc.
88 Rowland Way
Novato, CA 94945

Legal Department Reliant Communications, Inc. 801 International Parkway, 5th Fl. Lake Mary, FL 32746

Charles B Stewart Sage Telecom, Inc. 4603 John Garry Drive, Suite 11 Columbia, MO 65203 Legal Department Max-Tel Communications, Inc. 1720 Windward Concourse, Ste. 250 Alpharetta, GA 30005

Legal Department Midwestern Tel 2751 N. Ashland Ave. Chicago, IL 60614

Legal Department Missouri Telecom, Inc. 515 Cleveland, Ste. C Monett, MO 65708

Legal Department Now Acquisition Corporation 180 N. Wacker Dr., Ste. 3 Chicago, IL 60606

Legal Department
Phone-Link, Inc.
1700 Eastpoint Parkway
Suite 270
Louisville, Kentucky, 40223

Legal Department Premiere Paging & Cellular, Inc. 1114 Blue Bird Lane Liberty, MO 64068

Legal Department Quick-Tel, Inc. P.O. Box 1220 Bridgeport, TX 76426

Legal Department Ren-Tel Communications, Inc. 33 Black Forest Run Douglasville, GA 30134

Legal Department SBA Broadband Services, Inc. 5900 Broken Sound Pkwy., NW Boca Raton, FL 33487 Legal Department Metro Communications Company P.O. Box 555 Sullivan, IL 61951

Legal Department Missouri Comm South, Inc. 2909 N. Buckner Blvd., Ste. 800 Dallas, TX 75228

Legal Department
Navigator Telecommunications,
L.L.C.
8525 Riverwood Park Dr.
P.O. Box 13860
North Little Rock, AR 72113

Carol M Keith NuVox Communications of MO Inc. 16090 Swingley Ridge Chesterfield, MO 63017

Legal Department PNG Telecommunications, Inc. 100 Commercial Dr. Fairfield, Ohio, 45014

Legal Department QCC, Inc. 8829 Bond Street Overland Park, KS 66214

Legal Department Qwest Communications Corp. 1801 California St., 47th Floor Denver, Colorado, 80202

Legal Department Rocky Mountain Broadband, Inc. 999 18th St. #1825 Denver, Colorado, 80202

Legal Department ServiSense.com, Inc. 115 Shawnmut Road Canton, Massachusetts, 02021 Legal Department Simply Local Services, Inc. 2225 Apollo Dr Fenton, MO 63026

Legal Department Socket Telecom, LLC 811 Cherry St. Ste. 310 Columbia, MO 65201

Legal Department Suretel, Inc. 5 N. McCormick Oklahoma City, OK 73127

Legal Department TelCove 712 N. Main Street Coudersport, Pennsylvania 16915

Legal Department Telera Communications, Inc. 910 E. Hamilton Ave. Ste. 200 Campbell, CA 95008

Legal Department The Cube 7941 Katy Freeway #304 Houston, TX 77024

Legal Department Unite 303 N. Jefferson P.O. Box 891 Kearney, MO 64060

Legal Department Verizon Select Services, Inc. 6665 N. MacArthur Blvd. Irving, TX 75039

Legal Department Atlas Mobilfone, Inc. 1903 S. Glenstone Springfield, MO 65804 Legal Department Smoke Signal Communications 8700 S. Gessner Houston, TX 77074

Legal Department
Southern Telecom Network, Inc.
P.O. Box 1161
Mountain Home, AR 72653

Legal Department Talk America, Inc. 6805 Route 202 New Hope, PA 18938

Legal Department Telefonos Para Todos 14681 Midway Rd., Ste. 105 Addison, TX 75001

Legal Department Tele-Reconnect, Inc. 16925 Manchester Rd Wildwood, MO 63040

Legal Department Transamerican Telephone 209 E. University Danton, TX 76201

Legal Department Valor Communications CLEC of Mo, LLC 201 E. John Carpenter; Freeway #200 Irving, TX 75062

William D Steinmeier P.O. Box 104595 Jefferson City, MO 65110-4595

Legal Department
Bellsouth BSE, Inc.
400 Perimeter Center Terrace, Ste
400
Atlanta, GA 30346

Legal Department Snappy Phone 6901 W. 70th Street Shreveport, LA 71129

Legal Department Supra Telecommunications and Information Systems, Inc. 2620 S.W. 27th Ave. Miami, FL 33133

Legal Department Tel Com Plus 2277 19th Ave. SW Largo, FL 33774

Legal Department Telepacific Communications 515 S. Flower St. 47th Floor Los Angeles, CA 90071

Legal Department Teligent Services, Inc. 460 Herndon Parkway Ste. 100 Herndon, VA 20170

Legal Department TruComm Corporation 1608 Barclay Blvd. Buffalo Grove, IL 60089

Legal Department VarTec Telecom, Inc. 1600 Viceroy Dr. Dallas, TX 75235

Legal Department American Fiber Network, Inc. 9401 Indian Creek Pkwy., Ste. 140 Overland Park, KS 66210

Legal Department Big River Telephone Co. LLC 24 South Minnesota P.O. Box 1608 Cape Girardeau, MO 63702-1608 Legal Department Logix Communications Corporation 2950 N. Loop W., Ste. #1200 Houston, TX 77092-8839

Legal Department XO MO Inc. 2700 Summit Ave. Plano, TX 75074 Legal Department O1 Communications of MO LLC 2000 E. Lamar Blvd., Suite 730 Arlington, TX 76006

Legal Department 1-800-Reconex, Inc. 2500 Industrial Avenue Hubbard, OR 97032 Legal Department WTX Communications 11001 Wilcrest Dr., Suite 100 Houston, TX 77099

Mark W Com