# Appendix 3: Missouri GMO IRP May Stakeholder Meeting Distribution of Future Values of Uncertain Factors that Affect Supply-Side Resource Costs

May 20, 2010 EE-2009-0237



## **MDNR Deficiency #6**

- GMO's methodology for estimating the probability distribution for NO<sub>x</sub> allowance prices appears to be
  - substantively deficient
  - divergent from rule requirements
  - divergence from rule requirements is not supported by the language in Waiver #11



## **Objectives of GMO's Forecast**

- Conform to published regulations or use waiver
- Consistency between forecasts
- Recognize uncertainty
- Be cognizant of value of information



# From the Integrated Resource Planning Rules

- 22.040(8)(A) Fuel Price Forecast
  - 1. From consulting firm or expert
  - 2. Consider accuracy of previous forecasts
  - 3. Forecast shall:
    - Identify critical uncertain factors
    - Provide a range of forecasts
    - Subjective probability distribution



### From the Integrated Resource Planning Rules

- 22.040(8)(D) Emission Allowance Forecast
  - 1. From consulting firm or expert
  - 2. Forecast shall:
    - Identify critical uncertain factors
    - Provide a range of forecasts
    - Subjective probability distribution



### **Consensus Forecast**

- Addresses the rules:
  - Multiple consulting firms and experts
  - Consistently more accurate than most of the forecasts it represents
  - Can construct distribution

- Can be used for all fuel related commodities
- Uses readily available "off the shelf" forecasts



### **Monte Carlo Forecast**

- Does not address the Rules
  - Expert firm model "not for sale"
  - Unproven accuracy of fundamental model
  - Can construct distribution, but GIGO substantively deficient
- Expert firm models not available for all fuel related commodities
- Expensive consulting for custom model development



### **Objectives of GMO's Forecast**

- Conform to published regulations or use waiver
- Consistency between forecasts
- Recognize Uncertainty
- Be cognizant of value of information

