### BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In Re: Union Electric Company's	)	
2008 Utility Resource Filing Pursuant	)	Case No. EO-2007-0409
to 4 CSR 240- Chapter 22	)	

### PUBLIC COUNSEL'S COMMENTS IN RESPONSE TO OTHER PARTIES' COMMENTS

COMES NOW The Office of the Public Counsel and for its Comments in Response to Other Parties' Comments states as follows:

- 1. Pursuant to 4 CSR 240.22080(9), Public Counsel may file comments in response to other parties' comments. In orders issued on August 14, 2008, the Commission set September 12, 2008 as the filing date for these comments.
- 2. Public Counsel files these comments in response to the comments filed in this case by the Missouri Department of Natural Resources (DNR) and the comments filed by the Sierra Club, Missouri Coalition for the Environment, Mid-Missouri Peaceworks and the Association of Community Organizations for Reform Now (collectively, Sierra Club). Public Counsel's comments respond to two of the deficiencies noted in the reports of DNR and Sierra Club that are referenced at pages 22 and 23 in the unresolved deficiencies portion of the Joint Filing and Partial Stipulation and Agreement (Joint Filing) that was filed in this case on August 12, 2008.
- 3. As noted in paragraph 56 of the Joint Filing, DNR describes, on page 8 of the Synapse Attachment to its report, how:

AmerenUE failed to include a portfolio that represents a very aggressive approach for the achievable potential of the demand-side portfolio by leveling penetration after the first years, constraining incentive costs and other issues, which did not allow the Company to fully evaluate the impact that reductions under an .

aggressive portfolio could have on the magnitude of the Company's next capacity addition prior to making major commitments to that capacity addition.

Public Counsel agrees with DNR about the above described deficiency and believes it is important to address this deficiency before Union Electric Company (UE) makes a commitment to move forward with building Callaway 2 or any other new base load plant, or before the idea of Callaway 2 becomes so ingrained in UE's corporate culture that objective analysis is problematic.

4. As noted in subsection D. of paragraph 57 of the Joint Filing, Sierra Club describes, on page 6 of its report, how "the overnight costs and O&M costs given for US-EPR are unrealistically low and not consistent with the rule."

It is also important to address this deficiency before UE makes a commitment to move forward with building Callaway 2. Prior to making a decision to move forward with Callaway 2, it is vitally important for UE to have a reasonable estimate of the expected capital costs and a credible analysis of the risk that costs will vary from this estimate. This capital cost estimate and risk analysis should be subject to a rigorous review by this Commission to ensure that consumers are protected from being harmed by massive cost overruns due to miscalculations about the ultimate cost to consumers of this resource option.

The initial nuclear power plant building boom that occurred in this country during the 1970s and 1980s was distinguished by the massive cost overruns associated with many of the plants built during that time. Attachment A contains two slides from a presentation made by electric utility expert Paul L. Jaskow at the University of Paris on May 19, 2006. The second slide shows the extent of the massive cost overruns that occurred during the first nuclear building boom in the US when it was not unusual for utilities to incur 2 or 3 times the amount of costs that were initially estimated at the time decisions were made to build the plants.

5. Public Counsel requests that the Commission establish a procedural schedule,

including pre-filed testimony and a hearing, where the parties can present evidence to the

Commission regarding the unresolved deficiencies listed on pages 21 – 23 of the Joint Filing.

Prefiled testimony and an evidentiary hearing in this case will aid the Commission in making the

determinations under 4 CSR 240-22.080(13), which requires the Commission to:

issue an order which contains findings that the electric utility's filing pursuant to

this rule either does or does not demonstrate compliance with the requirements of this chapter, and that the utility's resource acquisition strategy either does or does

not meet the requirements stated in 4 CSR 240-22.010(2)(A)-(C)....

In addition to recommending that the Commission make the findings described above in

4 CSR 240-22.080(13) due to the serious unresolved deficiencies that have been cited by some of

the interveners in this case, Public Counsel will propose remedies for the Commission to order

that UE comply with, in order to protect ratepayers from the consequences of the unresolved

deficiencies.

WHEREFORE Public Counsel respectfully submits these Comments in Response to

Other Parties' Comments.

Respectfully submitted,

OFFICE OF THE Public Counsel

By: /s/ Lewis R. Mills, Jr.

Lewis R. Mills, Jr. (#35275)

**Public Counsel** 

P O Box 2230

Jefferson City, MO 65102

(573) 751-1304

(573) 751-5562 FAX

lewis.mills@ded.mo.gov

3

#### **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that copies of the foregoing have been emailed to all parties this 12th day of September 2008.

General Counsel Office Missouri Public Service Commission 200 Madison Street, Suite 800 P.O. Box 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102 GenCounsel@psc.mo.gov Mills Lewis
Office Of Public Counsel
200 Madison Street, Suite 650
P.O. Box 2230
Jefferson City, MO 65102
opcservice@ded.mo.gov

Dottheim Steve Missouri Public Service Commission 200 Madison Street, Suite 800 P.O. Box 360 Jefferson City, MO 65102 Steve.Dottheim@psc.mo.gov

Boudreau A Paul Aquila Networks 312 East Capitol Avenue P.O. Box 456 Jefferson City, MO 65102 PaulB@brydonlaw.com

Morrison A Bruce Association of Community Organizations for Reform Now 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 bamorrison@greatriverslaw.org Robertson B Henry Association of Community Organizations for Reform Now 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org

Henry G Kathleen Association of Community Organizations for Reform Now 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 khenry@greatriverslaw.org Morrison A Bruce Mid-Missouri Peaceworks 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 bamorrison@greatriverslaw.org Robertson B Henry Mid-Missouri Peaceworks 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org

Henry G Kathleen Mid-Missouri Peaceworks 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 khenry@greatriverslaw.org Morrison A Bruce
Missouri Coalition for the
Environment
705 Olive Street, Suite 614
St. Louis, MO 63101
bamorrison@greatriverslaw.org

Robertson B Henry Missouri Coalition for the Environment 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org

Henry G Kathleen Missouri Coalition for the Environment 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 khenry@greatriverslaw.org

Woods A Shelley Missouri Department of Natural Resources P.O. Box 899 Jefferson City, MO 65102-0899 shelley.woods@ago.mo.gov Langeneckert C Lisa Missouri Energy Group One City Centre, 15th Floor 515 North Sixth Street St. Louis, MO 63101 Ilangeneckert@spvg.com

Downey F Edward Missouri Industrial Energy Consumers 221 Bolivar Street, Suite 101 Jefferson City, MO 65101 efdowney@bryancave.com Vuylsteke M Diana Missouri Industrial Energy Consumers 211 N. Broadway, Suite 3600 St. Louis, MO 63102 dmvuylsteke@bryancave.com

Healy Douglas Missouri Joint Municipal Electric Utility Commission 939 Boonville Suite A Springfield, MO 65802 doug@healylawoffices.com Kincheloe E Duncan Missouri Joint Municipal Electric Utility Commission 1808 I-70 Dr. SW Columbia, MO 65203 dkincheloe@mjmeuc.org Conrad Stuart Noranda Aluminum, Inc. 3100 Broadway, Suite 1209 Kansas City, MO 64111 stucon@fcplaw.com Morrison A Bruce Sierra Club 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 bamorrison@greatriverslaw.org

Robertson B Henry Sierra Club 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org Henry G Kathleen Sierra Club 705 Olive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis, MO 63101 khenry@greatriverslaw.org Sullivan R Steven Union Electric Company 1901 Chouteau Avenue P.O. Box 66149 (MC 1300) St. Louis, MO 63166-6149 srsullivan@ameren.com

Byrne M Thomas Union Electric Company 1901 Chouteau Avenue P.O. Box 66149 (MC 131) St. Louis, MO 63166-6149 tbyrne@ameren.com Tatro Wendy Union Electric Company 1901 Chouteau Avenue St. Louis, MO 63166-6149 wtatro@ameren.com

By: /s/ Lewis R. Mills, Jr.

## PROSPECTS FOR NUCLEAR POWER A U.S. PERSPECTIVE

Paul L. Joskow



University of Paris – Dauphine May 19, 2006

# HISTORICAL U.S. CONSTRUCTION COST EXPERIENCE

75 (pre-TMI) plants operating in 1986: \$2002/kWe

Construction	<b>Estimated</b>	Actual	<b>%</b>
<b>Started</b>	<b>Overnight Cost</b>	<b>Overnight Cost</b>	<b>OVER</b>
1966-67	\$ 560/kWe	\$1,170/kWe	209%
1968-69	<b>\$ 679</b>	<b>\$2,000</b>	294%
<b>1970-71</b>	<b>\$ 760</b>	<b>\$2,650</b>	348%
1972-73	<b>\$1,117</b>	\$3,555	318%
1974-75	<b>\$1,156</b>	<b>\$4,410</b>	381%
1976-77	<b>\$1,493</b>	<b>\$4,008</b>	269%

Source: U.S. EIA