FILED
July 31, 2015
Data Center
Missouri Public
Service Commission

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In the Matter of Union Electric Company d/b/a Ameren	)	
Missouri's Filing to Implement Regulatory Changes in	)	File No. EO-2012-0142
Furtherance of Energy Efficiency as allowed by MEEIA.	)	

#### **NOTIFICATION**

COMES NOW Union Electric Company d/b/a Ameren Missouri (Ameren Missouri or Company) and, pursuant to the terms of the *Unanimous Stipulation and Agreement Resolving Ameren Missouri's MEEIA Filing (Stipulation*), submits the following:

- 1. The *Stipulation* requires Ameren Missouri to file a notice in this case no less than five business days prior to making a change in its measure and/or incentive amount offering. <sup>1</sup>
- 2. Concurrently with filing this Notification Ameren Missouri is making a tariff filing relating to its Energy Star® New Homes Program that is designed to limit its availability to those homes that reserve a rebate prior to the effective date of the new tariff (June 21, 2014). This tariff filing is being made because it has been determined that the Program is not cost-effective. A copy of the Company's report discussing the lack of cost-effectiveness of the Program is included with this Notification.
- 3. Consequently, the Company's currently-on-file Residential Energy Efficiency Measures and Incentive listing has been modified to delete the information relating to the Energy Star® New Homes Program effective June 21, 2014. A copy of the revised listing is included with this filing.
- 4. In addition, the Company's web pages for energy efficiency will be modified (effective June 21, 2014) to remove pages or make other modifications necessary to reflect the

Date 7-22-15 Reporter 717
File No. 60-2015-005-5

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> File No. EO-2012-0142, Unanimous Stipulation and Agreement Resolving Ameren Missouri's MEEIA Filing, p. 14

discontinuance of the Program. Copies of the web pages as they will appear starting June 21, 2014 are also included with this Notification.

4. The foregoing has been discussed with the Staff, Public Counsel and the Division of Energy who have expressed their support of these changes.

WHEREFORE, Ameren Missouri respectfully files this Notice in compliance with the terms of the Unanimous Stipulation and Agreement Resolving Ameren Missouri's MEEIA Filing.

Respectfully submitted,

UNION ELECTRIC COMPANY, d/b/a Ameren Missouri

Wendy K. Tatro, #60261 Corporate Counsel Thomas M. Byrne, #33340 Director and Assistant General Counsel Ameren Services Company P.O. Box 66149, MC 1310 St. Louis, MO 63166-6149 (314) 554-3484 (phone) (314) 554-2514 (314) 554-4014 (fax) AmerenMOService@ameren.com

/s/ James B. Lowery

James B. Lowery MBN#40503 Smith Lewis, LLP 111 S. Ninth Street, Ste. 200 P.O. Box 918 Columbia, MO 65205

Telephone:

(573) 443-3141 Fax: (573) 442-6686

Email: lowery@smithlewis.com

ATTORNEYS FOR UNION ELECTRIC COMPANY d/b/a AMEREN MISSOURI

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that true and correct copies of the foregoing have been e-mailed to the service list of record this 22nd day of May, 2014.

General Counsel's Office
Missouri Public Service Commission
Nathan Williams
P.O. Box 360
200 Madison Street, Suite 800
Jefferson City, Missouri 65102
gencounsel@psc.mo.gov

Barnes-Jewish Hospital Lisa Langeneckert P.O. Box 411793 St. Louis, MO 63141 llangeneckert@att.net

Nathan. Williams@psc.mo.gov

KCP&L Greater Missouri Operations Company Roger Steiner P.O. Box 418679 1200 Main Street, 16th Floor Kansas City MO 64105-9679 roger.steiner@kcpl.com

Kansas City Power & Light Company

Missouri Department of Natural Resources
Frazier S Jennifer
P.O. Box 899
221 West High Street
Jefferson City MO 65102
jenny.frazier@ago.mo.gov

Office of the Public Counsel
Dustin Allison
P.O. Box 2230
200 Madison Street, Suite 650
Jefferson City, MO 65102-2230
opcservice@ded.mo.gov

Kansas City Power & Light Company KCP&L Greater Missouri Operations Company James Fischer 101 Madison Street, Suite 400 Jefferson City MO 65101 jfischerpc@aol.com

Laclede Gas Company
Michael Pendergast
Rick Zucker
720 Olive Street, Suite 1520
St. Louis MO 63101
mpendergast@lacledegas.com
rzucker@lacledegas.com

Missouri Industrial Energy Consumers (MIEC)
Diana Vuylsteke
211 N. Broadway, Suite 3600
St. Louis MO 63102
dmvuylsteke@bryancave.com

**Natural Resources Defense Council** Renew Missouri Sierra Club Henry Robertson 705 Ólive Street, Suite 614 St. Louis MO 63101 hrobertson@greatriverslaw.org

Isl James B. Lowery
James B. Lowery

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In the Matter of Union Electric Company d/b/a	)	
Ameren Missouri's Filing to Implement Regulatory	)	
Changes in Furtherance of Energy Efficiency as	)	File No. EO-2012-0142
Allowed by MEEIA.	j	

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO APPROVE THE DISCONTINUATION OF PROGRAM AND APPROVE TARIFF SHEET

COMES NOW Staff of the Missouri Public Service Commission, by and through the undersigned counsel, and files this Recommendation with the Missouri Public Service Commission to state as follows:

- 1. On July 5, 2012, Union Electric Company d/b/a Ameren Missouri ("Ameren Missouri") and the parties to this case filed (or did not object to) a *Unanimous Stipulation and Agreement Resolving Ameren Missouri's MEEIA Filing* ("Stipulation"). The Commission approved the *Stipulation* by Order on August 1, 2012.
- 2. In part, the *Stipulation* provided for Ameren Missouri's implementation of 11 Demand-Side Management Programs pursuant to the Missouri Energy Efficiency Investment Act ("MEEIA")<sup>1</sup>, including the Energy Star<sup>®</sup> New Homes Program. The *Stipulation* also requires Ameren Missouri to hire a contractor to complete Evaluation, Measurement and Verification ("EM&V") reports on its MEEIA programs and file final EM&V reports 135 days after the end of each MEEIA program year.<sup>2</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Section 393.1075, RSMo (Supp. 2013).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Unanimous Stipulation And Agreement Resolving Ameren Missouri's MEEIA Filing, pp. 15-19. Ameren Missouri and Staff are currently working together to identify areas of the EM&V reports filed May 15, 2014, and revised May 28, 2014, where additional work needs to be performed by Ameren Missouri's EM&V contractor, The Cadmus Group, Inc. Staff understands that Cadmus will produce a new set of EM&V reports for filing.

Notification contains the information required in (A). Information for (B) and (C) is not attached as part of the Notification, but other filings in this case contain the information.<sup>3</sup>

- 6. Staff has reviewed the initial EM&V report and the additional analysis of the cost-effectiveness of the Energy Star® New Homes Program provided by Ameren Missouri. The initial EM&V report and analysis determined the program is not cost-effective, with a total resource cost test score of 0.18. In other words, 72% of the gross energy savings reported from the program resulted from measures installed by participating builders who were already building efficient homes without the program's incentives and are, therefore, free riders. Free Riders are defined as those participants who most likely would have adopted the energy efficiency measure on their own without a utility incentive.
- 7. One of the decision points for the Commission's approval of a MEEIA program plan under Rule 4 CSR 240-20.094(3)(A) is whether the program has a total resource cost test ratio greater than one (1), indicating the program's cost effectiveness. While the EM&V reports are not yet finalized, Staff generally agrees with the results and recommends the Commission approve Ameren Missouri's filing to discontinue the Energy Star® New Homes Program and approve the tariff sheet, both conditioned on Ameren Missouri providing an affidavit to support its *Notification*.
- 8. The *Notification* does not provide the general background information or an affidavit to verify the information contained in the application as required by Rule 4 CSR 240-2.060. Staff is not opposed to a limited waiver of Rule 4 CSR 240-2.060 should Ameren Missouri provide the affidavit requirement prior to a Commission order

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> EM&V reports are filed in this case as EFIS # 150 and 154; EFIS # 157, *Notice Regarding Change Request*, discusses when Ameren Missouri and Staff expect final EM&V reports.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I do hereby certify that a true and correct copy of the foregoing document has been emailed this 6<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2014 to all parties of record in this proceeding.

**Isl Jennifer Hernandez** 

#### MEMORANDUM

TO:

Missouri Public Service Commission Official Case File

File No. EO-2012-0142, Tariff Tracking No. YE-2014-0473

Union Electric Company d/b/a Ameren Missouri

FROM:

Hojong Kang, Regulatory Economist III

/s/ John Rogers

06/06/2014

/s/ Jennifer Hernandez 06/06/2014

Energy Resource Analysis Unit / Date

Staff Counsel's Office / Date

SUBJECT:

Staff Recommendation For Approval Of Tariff Sheet For the Residential Energy

Star® New Homes Program

DATE:

June 6, 2014

On May 22, 2014, Union Electric Company d/b/a Ameren Missouri ("Ameren Missouri") filed one (1) proposed tariff sheet bearing an effective date of June 21, 2014. The Commission assigned the tariff sheet Tariff Tracking No. YE-2014-0473. With this tariff sheet, Ameren Missouri proposes to modify its Energy Star® New Homes Program to limit its availability to builders of single family homes that reserved a rebate prior to the effective date of the proposed tariff sheet–June 21, 2014. Ameren Missouri made this tariff filing because The Cadmus Group, Inc. ("Cadmus"), Ameren Missouri's evaluation, measurement and verification ("EM&V") contractor for its residential MEEIA¹ programs, states in its independent EM&V report that it has determined the program is not cost-effective. Further, Ameren Missouri expects that it cannot make the program cost effective by redesigning it. Staff generally agrees with both Cadmus and Ameren Missouri and recommends approval of the proposed tariff sheet.²

The Energy Star® New Homes Program was designed to encourage home builders to build energy efficient homes, typically Energy Star® certified homes. However, based on the EM&V report³ results for Program Year 2013, the savings associated with this program were considerably lower than those expected. The program's very low Total Resource Cost test score, 0.18, results from Cadmus' findings, presented in its EM&V report, that 72% of the gross energy savings reported from the program resulted from measures installed by participating builders

<sup>1</sup> The Missouri Energy Efficiency Investment Act ("MEEIA"), Section 393.1075, RSMo, Supp. 2012. On August 1, 2012, the Commission approved Ameren Missouri's MEEIA Programs' 3-year plan including its Energy Star® New Homes Program. On May 15, 2014, Ameren Missouri filed Cadmus' initial EM&V reports, subsequently revised on May 28, 2014.

<sup>2</sup> Under the Stipulation and Agreement approved by the Commission on August 1, 2012 in File No. EO-2012-0142, any stakeholder, as well as the Commission's EM&V auditor, have until 21 days after Ameren Missouri files final EM&V reports to review the reports and file any request with the Commission to request a change to the impact evaluation portion of a final EM&V report. The impact evaluation includes estimations of annual energy savings in kWh and net benefits for each MEEIA Program and for the MEEIA plan.

<sup>3</sup> On May 28, 2014, Cadmus' revised its 2013 EM&V reports for all Ameren Missouri's residential energy efficiency programs. Ameren Missouri and Staff continue to work together to identify areas of the EM&V Reports that Cadmus should perform additional work on. Staff understands that Cadmus will produce a new final set of EM&V reports for filing.

## BEFORE THE PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

## OF THE STATE OF MISSOURI

In the Matter of Union Electronic Company d/b/a Ameren Miss Filing to Implement Regular Changes Furtherance of Electronic Efficiency as Allowed by ME	souri's datory Energy	) ) ) )	Case No. EO-2012-0142 File No. YE-2014-0473			
AFFIDAVIT OF HOJONG KANG						
STATE OF MISSOURI COUNTY OF COLE	) ) ss )					
Hojong Kang, of lawful age, on oath states: that he participated in the preparation of the foregoing Staff Recommendation in memorandum form, to be presented in the above case; that the information in the Staff Recommendation was provided to him; that he has knowledge of the matters set forth in such Staff Recommendation; and that such matters are true to the best of his knowledge and belief.						
		Á	Hojong Kang			
Subscribed and sworn to before me this <u>lot</u> day of June, 2014.						
SUSAN L. SUNDERMEY Notary Public - Notary S State of Missouri Commissioned for Callaway My Commission Expires: Octobe Commission Number: 109	Seal / County er 03, 2014	Suc	Notary Public			

## STATE OF MISSOURI PUBLIC SERVICE COMMISSION

At a session of the Public Service Commission held at its office in Jefferson City on the 19<sup>th</sup> day of June, 2014.

In the Matter of Union Electric Company d/b/a	)	
Ameren Missouri's Filing to Implement Regulatory	)	File No. EO-2012-0142
Changes in Furtherance of Energy Efficiency	)	Tariff No. YE-2014-0473
as Allowed by MEEIA	)	

# ORDER APPROVING TERMINATION OF ENERGY STAR NEW HOMES PROGRAM, AND APPROVING TARIFF

Issue Date: June 19, 2014 Effective Date: June 21, 2014

On May 22, 2014, Union Electric Company, d/b/a Ameren Missouri, filed a Notification indicating its intent to terminate its Energy Star New Homes Program. At the same time, it issued a revised tariff sheet to implement that change. The revised tariff carries an effective date of June 21. Staff filed a recommendation on June 6, advising the Commission to approve the company's termination of the program and to approve the implementing tariff.

Staff's recommendation explains that the Energy Star New Homes Program was intended to encourage home builders to build energy efficient homes. However, an independent evaluation of the program for Program Year 2013 showed that the program was not cost efficient. Essentially, the program has paid builders to incorporate energy-efficient elements that they would have incorporated even without the incentive program.

3. This order shall become effective on June 21, 2014.

### BY THE COMMISSION



Morris L. Woodruff Secretary

Morris & Woodruff

R. Kenney, Chm., Stoll, W. Kenney Hall, and Rupp, CC., concur.

Woodruff, Chief Regulatory Law Judge